FINISHED TRANSCRIPT

2013 APrIGF SEOUL

4 SEPTEMBER 2013

1530‑1625 CET

ASIA‑PACIFIC REGIONAL IGF CONFERENCE SEOUL ROOM:

LECTURE ROOM 2

INTERNET ACCESSIBILITY IN THE AP REGION

Services provided by:

Caption First, Inc.

P.O. Box 3066

Monument, CO 80132

1‑877‑825‑5234

+001‑719‑481‑9835

\* \* \* \* \*

This is being provided in a rough‑draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in Order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

\* \* \* \* \*

(Non‑English announcement.)

[Silence.]

>> And the government's policy for Internet development. Different institutions give different definitions, but defines broadband as 256 kilo BP download. According to such definition, broadband, in fact, means Internet.

As of August 2012, the number of smartphone users in Korea exceeded 30 million, and the number of LT service subscribers surpassed 10 million, which means 20 percent of the total mobile phone users are using LT service. Korea also successfully compilated 100 megaBPS service.

In the previous slide, I presented about economic events of ICT in Korea, but it is clear that Internet affects not only economy, the whole sector of our society, including politics, society and culture. Internet plays a leading role in opening up societies and initiating changes while promoting individuals' creativity and talent.

In Korea, Internet strategy in 1982 as SDN which connected Seoul National University and KEIT‑‑ protocol. The SDN was the second network in the world that use TCIP protocol and in 1986 it gained the IP address from the ‑‑

Then I will give you a broad overview on Korea's Internet. Broadband service started to be provided in Korea by ISPs since 1999. And in the following decade, the number of Internet subscribers exploded. According to the recent statistics, 97 percent of Korean households had access to the broadband, and our mobile broadband penetration rate reached 100 percent, which is the number 1 among ‑‑ Member States.

This slide shows Korea's IC infrastructure level compared to other countries. Korea ranked the world's number 1 at the economist UN, and ITU‑C index. And in 2011, even U.S. President Obama mentioned Korea as the role model for successful Internet access.

The Korean government has been heavily investing in information and telecommunication sectors since 1980s. Their government succeeded in commercializing CDMA technology in 1990s for the first time and also put its effort in spreading the infrastructure of the broadband service.

The Korea government took the lead in developing ICT infrastructure as it released a series of master plans. The PCN broadband convergence network project was launched in 2004 with the aim of upgrading the Internet speed up to 1 megahundred BPS to prepare ourselves for the new convergence service such as IPTV.

In 2009, Korea released UBCN, ultra BCN, to provide 1 gig an BPS‑‑ Internet network. Which is 10 times faster than the existing network.

Under long‑term master plans and policy objectives, the Korean government is pursuing the development of broadband in connection with market situation, policies and regulation policies.

Let me give you specific examples of Korean policies. The KIA., Korea information infrastructure project, released in 1995, aimed to build high speed national network and high speed public network. The high speed national network gave rise to the broadband demand as the government directly invested in the network that connected the public agencies and that the network be used by research institutes and schools at low cost.

The high speed public network was left to the private companies for voluntary investment while the government gave the various incentives and closely monitored the effects of the network establishment. It is still evaluated as the effective policy that generated both demand and supply as the government's direct investment encouraged the private demand while competition among private companies led to the rise in supply.

To address the problem of this divide between urban and rural areas, their government‑mandated KT, Korea Telecom to build the 1 megaBPS network. As a result, by 2008, almost all areas of our territory have been covered with more than 1 megaBPS Internet work.

The government has also carried out e‑government projects so that the Korean people can easily access various information their government has and address tax procurement issues and addressable petitions.

The MSIP, ministry of science, ICT and ‑‑ is conducting various projects to advance network technologies and create new services. One of them is gig an Internet promotion project, which aims to offer 1 year BPS Internet connections to 90 percent of Internet users across Korea by 2017. Also, more than 10,000 free public WiFi ‑‑ will be built as part of a policy to reduce gap in Internet use among various regions and social classes. The government is also implementing policies to promote cloud computing and big data solution.

Preventing side effects that can ‑‑ with increasing broadband use is very critical. We need a comprehensive approach to address Internet‑related side effects by implementing various policies on all line privacy protection, cyber security, web accessibility and Internet ethics.

Korea has continued to work with the countries in the Asia Pacific region to achieve corporate prosperity. The effort includes joint research through TAN, trans‑Russian ‑‑ network. Invitational training courses in various programmes that help other countries to share Korea's best practices. Korea has also contributed to the development of the Asian Pacific region by hosting a number of international events, including next year's ITU Plenipotentiary Conference and today's Forum, as well.

Now, let me briefly introduce you to the key to success in broadband development and policies. First, the government has implemented various policies to promote broadband use. Policies to promote competition by, for example, lowering barriers to market entrance, policy to boost market demand and also direct government investment into R & D and infrastructure. The private sector, on the other hand, predicted the market demand and heavily invested in technology development, infrastructure and service. Internet users also did their part by sharing their ideas on Internet service. Extensive involvement and participation from various stakeholders were the key to the broadband development in Korea.

Before I conclude, let me leave you with this final thought that policymakers need a long‑term perspective in designing a broadband policy that predicts and address the society effects. Thank you very much.

[Applause.]

>> PHETSAMONE XILYVONG: Good evening, Ladies and Gentlemen. My name is Phetsamone Xilyvong from Laos. I'm pleased to be here to ‑‑ I would like to share with you some information from our country. In my present position, there are two parts in my present, one part general information my country and the other part about the technical information.

Okay general information on Laos. Large country, people are friendly the population is more than 6.5 million ‑‑ last linkage ‑‑ capital. 100,000. This is DLA.

Now, there are three operators in Laos. PSNG over there. And there is Laos has four operators for device network and have six ISP, Internet service provider. Okay, that's general information on Laos.

Now, introduce you to ministry report on telecommunication. MPG. And of course 2011, national authorities of the posts and telecommunications in ATP, that's before ‑‑ TV. Device from the ministry of telecommunication transport and construction. In June 2011, Laos has new government. After this from telecommunications becomes a ministry and post telecommunication, MPT.

Now, MTP organisation just there are some departments in the Ministry. Yeah ‑‑ centre.

LANIC is under one departments under ministry of post telecommunication. Nonprofit organisation. The Lanix just control gateway, control authority management, IP transit is and connector oversee. In the future, LANIC may become the registry ‑‑ LANIC. Try to ‑‑ Laos.

There are some ‑‑ LANIC's main function. The one function is national exchange. Stream in the LANIC exchange from the LANIC. We have Internet, we had the LANIC control the ‑‑ and we have national Internet exchange in the LANIC. This means control. We have CCRD, country code domains.la. Registry system. Now, under construction and infrastructure to redeploy the system, construction Minister. Centre, important information the government employed a system in the LANIC because the last one, security emergency air respond team. In the division, after I move to the security ‑‑ emergency respond team. This is my division now.

There are some information about the operator and ISPs in Laos. I said before we have four operators and we have six ISP, Internet service provider. We have Laos Telecom. It is a big country now. And the market serving the mobile ‑‑ represents belong to the government ‑‑ now. And you have Star Telecom. Star Telecom now is corporate with Vietnam. And government, just talky. And ‑‑ Beli. Now is Russian. Private companies now. Now has become private company.

Next one is planet online. And Sky Telecom. 2005, in Laos government, corporate ‑‑ must now belong to MOD, MOD is ‑‑ okay? Some Internet providers in Laos. LTC, Laos Telecom. But now try to deploy the 4 G in the capital area.

Next one is ETL, really famous. 3, 4, 5Gs. And the next one.

One analysis only now. Sky Telecom really strong with fiber optics because it belongs to the MOD, really strong, the corporation.

I will show you some statistics in the PSN and the mobile developments. You see Laos country, neighbor's country. Mobile network develop really fast. Plus telephones network very slow. You can see. This information you can see. Really fast.

And talk about marketing. Laos mobile ‑‑ now there are over 5.4 million mobile subscribers. Of course marketing policies and technology, Star Telecom and Laos telecom in the market.

Okay. Now summarize the Internet subscribers. This is all information.

Now, there is some Internet user statistic. Now there is over 162 Internet users and over 200,000 ‑‑ 215 physical subscribers in Laos, in the Internet and corporate to oversea.

Main purpose, main means ‑‑ and students and officials use Internet very much in Laos.

Gateway, Laos gateway, international gateways and national gateway.

Okay. Last is main point. Laos can connect with other country. Neighbors country.

Now Internet activity. Laos have many subcontract point with LANIC, with the overseas and in some panels and some neighbors' country, we have connect with the bandwidth with Vietnam, with the BDC with get Tel and with Thailand. And now we try to connect with ‑‑ telecom with bandwidth.

In domestic, connect with each other with voice and IP transit by themself.

In the near future, I have the paren, every connect by the one point, by get the LANIC only. Now we try to upgrade the infrastructure. On ESPs in the near future we have LANIC only. IPs and everything in Internet. So we are the LANIC, that's the main proposal of the Laos government established LANIC. Okay?

I want to show you some transmission system. Laos have transmission system. Now we have the transmission to every province of the country. And we connect to the OOC. We connect to China's 3 points, Vietnam's 9 points and other countries. Never one country connected by the transmissions.

I will save you some information, security in Laos. Nervous country have the same problem. We have to ‑‑ from the interiors for scan and spam mails also and text from Hector means service in Laos always outside by hackers, that's problem.

So we always have problem with malware. Some software not Copyright. There is now really famous in Laos. Now insurance. Laos Internet agree very fast, incredibly fast. But Laos has no policies and has no cyber law to concern. When something happen, difficult to the police and we get some benefits because I know no laws and now no master plans for the ICT. So go to Laos government to ‑‑ in security.

Laos tried to make some law. Now under draft the cyber law security. Cooperates with the MTP, cooperates with the MOPS, that means ministry of public security, and ministry of law, to cooperate and set up special team to develop and to draft the cyber laws now, now under construction in drafting. We can just ‑‑

And some other information you can see on the website. I summarized the website of Laos information on ICT thank you for your attention.

[Applause.]

>> (non‑English).

>> The Laos policy and others. Thank you very much for sharing with us. Next we will hear from Vietnam.

>> TRAN XUAN DUNG: Good evening, hi, everyone. My name Tran Xuan Dung. I work in ministry information and communication and social Vietnam. And now I in Ho Chi Minh City. From here I want to information with the brand about Internet access in Vietnam.

I have from 1 to 5. You can see ‑‑ you now Vietnam have ‑‑ Vietnam have and ‑‑ 4,000 island very small. And economic ‑‑ cheap poor Internet on the island. Population of Vietnam have ‑‑ ethnic group. 2012, about 88 million people ‑‑ open population about 27 million, 800 ITI. 49,951,000 ‑‑ men or woman about 97 percent. Vietnam Internet 97 went from rural remote island have ‑‑ Internet user can connect through ‑‑ technology with ‑‑ wireless treaty mobile phone. Users can access the Internet ‑‑ depending upon their use ‑‑ at hotel, coffee shop, supermarket, airport. Education, government ‑‑ information online social network, only radio and TV communication ‑‑ online. Commercial ‑‑ Internet developed LAN from 2010. Issue the system now from about development plan of Vietnam Internet and telecommunication in 2010 with ‑‑ from universal Internet to ‑‑ of the country to serving in quality Internet ‑‑ which went from 8 to 12 ‑‑ 25 percent to 35 percent of the population. For ‑‑ teacher, doctor, student, college professional, secondary ‑‑ and secondary school have condition to use Internet, universal Internet to nationwide 201070 percent public Internet except one. Percent of the chip and commune in the economic early were broadband Internet service. Provincial government and digit and connect to why early network of government two university collect professional secondary school and universal secondary school connect to broadband Internet except 90 percent of ‑‑ capital connect to the Internet. Statistical development of information 1,000 with ‑‑ office. 1,000 ‑‑ 615 magazine. 67 websites of radio and TV station. 74 ‑‑ 336 social network. 1,10074 ‑‑ Internet information. Recent data of ‑‑ 2010 ‑‑ about 37 percent. 34 percent. Denang 47 percent. National elect 2010 with ‑‑ and 6 percent. Also connect to the Internet around 1 million, 2012 with 3 G mobile network developed 5,498. 13,700 separate. 5,485 mobile subscriber. According to reports June 2012, mobile network, mobile phone nationally there are 59,000 BTF station with 20,000 station, national ‑‑ 32,000 to 20 traditional domain name.vn about 202,374.

And Vietnam now have a broadcasting satellite by TV, direct analog DVT. Mobile network, my TV and robotic by Vianet, 2012 about 31 million,907 Internet users approaches 35 and 49 percent population. 10 million we will have ‑‑ community of 500,000 people ‑‑ population of Vietnam three Internet indispensable daily. According to Vietnam ‑‑ you can see all right Vietnam user, Vietnam have user, Internet user. According by VVNIC, Vietnam have Internet use right. Issue in green Internet. Set video on live scan. Buying and selling commodity financial. Later tell, nickname tell. Email attack. Thousands copyright. High tech. We call Vietnam have the recollection of Laos, you can see a number of the regular ‑‑ many on Internet ‑‑ regulation of laws.

Vietnam have best monitoring daemon of central and local. Moral education can listen ‑‑ 37 July 2012 the three ministers recent number 32 upload if development plan of national telecommunication in 2020 with target of Internet development, 2015, survivor of broadband from CIT to both 100, population and mobile survivor 20 to 25 ‑‑ subscriber. Percent of Internet 15 to 20 percent Internet user 40 to 45 percent population, 90 percent community have in public telecommunication broadband Internet connect. 202215 to 20 survival percent. Broadband supply 35 to 30. With Internet 35 to 40 percent rate of Internet users to 100 percent of communities have in providing public telecommunication broadband Internet connection. Development of rural information and communication barriers 2011‑2020. VNNIC and NTT communications cooperate to build international connections for national IPv6 test network. Telecommunication provides barrier 2011 to 2015.

Planning develop national safety information safety to 2020. Thank you so much.

[Applause.]

>> Thank you very much for sharing the Vietnam situation also the development plan, as well. Next we'll hear from Marshall Island and then a presentation. Mr. Matt, please start your presentation. Good afternoon, everybody, I'm Rommel Natividad from the Marshall Islands for the Minister of telecommunications. For the past six years I've been working or six years with the ministry, five years of which I was a spectrum manager and then this year as a director of communications. I'll do my best not to put you to sleep and keep you awake. Please bear with me.

Okay. Everyone is asking me every time I attend a gathering or a Forum where is marshal islands? As you can see Marshall I he Islands is in the middle of the Pacific Ocean. In total, there's only 70 square miles of land. And within the 2 million square miles of body of water. So it's really a dot, not even a dot. So this is the regional map. This is Marshall Islands, this is Hawaii and Guam. There's only two ways to go into Marshall Islands, going through Guam, go in to east or go in from Asia, going all the way to Hawaii and then going back to the west. That's the two. Roughly it's around $2,000 to go to Marshall Islands from Asia alone.

So this is domestic map or the national map. This is where the capital. And our means of like the Marshall Islands is dependent on foreign aid. We get assistance from U.S., Australia, Korea, Japan, sorry if I missed some countries. And then there's a secondary urban centre which is Ibai. Where is Ebai. Here. By the way ‑‑ one of the islands is being rented by the United States for the Osaka mission. It stands for U.S. Army ‑‑ missile test range.

Okay. Next would be, okay. I mentioned this so I'll go population is roughly 60,000. And in Ebai, there's 20,000. And Maduro, there's 20,000 and around 20,000 is scattered all over the 2 million square miles of body of water in which maybe around 60 square miles of land. And then the rest also migrated to either Hawaii or main land U.S.

Big government, Marshall Islands is a ‑‑ parliamentary is a democracy and free association with the United States Government. It's called COFA, Compact of Free Association, as amended 2004.

Telecommunications, by legislative conditions, MTA, Marshall Islands telecommunications provider. Service includes ETNN, GSM, telecentres, ISP, and HF and television, which only the ‑‑ is being served and major at all.

Economy mainly relies as I said on U.S. funding brought about by the compact of the free association. Grant assistance from diplomatic partners such as U.S., Japan, Taiwan, European Union and Korea. Foreign investors, just to name a few, to develop the country's economy mainly on educational health system and infrastructure. There's a map again of the Marshall Islands. Okay. A little trivia. On where the Marshall Islands is if you're still wondering where it is. Did you know that in the 1950s, the United States tested a nuclear bomb just right after World War II? They tested the bomb. It's called Castle Bravo. A lot of nuclear bombs. So it is tested in bikini. Thus one French engineer protested, so he designed a bathing suit. He split the bathing suit into two piece. So that's why it's called bikini. Bik means surface, ni means coconut. So that's the bikini was coined after that. So don't get offended if you see someone wearing bikini, because they're paying tribute to Marshall Islands, that's bikini. Okay, by the way, this is Castle Bravo tested at bikini Atol. You'll see some designs of bikini and then there's Angelina Joe Lee of the tomb raider, wearing a bikini. Okay, you can check on this in Wikipedia. Just type operation cross roads or bikini. Bikini Atol. So again that's where Marshall Islands is. So, this is beach, I went to Busan, I strolled around. This is where you can see some bikinis. Then you will remember Marshall Islands. The internet arrived Marshall Islands 1990s, but that is through satellite. NS5. I think it is NSS5 now. And then by 2010, the fiberoptic arrived on the shores of the Marshall Islands specifically through Guam. We call it critical infrastructure. So this is the PSTN. There's two towers, three, sorry. Then we're using an analog signal before going up and then to the international gateway. And now there's the cable TV and then afterwards after that the fiberoptic came in and then the rest of the country, which is this, Arthur island developed and underserved, they communicate through HF radio only. And then there's the telecentre, 88 telecentres which set up costs around 30,000 U.S. dollars. So serving maybe five people, 10, 15, 20. So they only focus on maybe around 100 up. And there's the Likipato, island much Lapato. This is what we call this, foreign assistance through Japan projects and ITU projects, APT projects. So we installed some telecentres.

Okay. There are telecentres that was a joint venture, I mean a partnership between the NTA and then the ministry. This is all the telecentres. 29 sites. Again, each one is 30,000 U.S. dollars worth of infrastructure. Connecting up is a different issue on how to make it sustainable.

Okay, down remote site, this is based on demand connection. So like a pay‑as‑you‑go.

So there's 2,000 watt solar panel, amplifier, satellite dish, satellite remote terminal, one laptop, one phone, one fax machine. Community there is already happy with this setup.

This setup it is a start policy on the Internet connectivity. On the outer island it's only 64. They're already lucky to get 64 KBPS connection. That's not even a broadband.

In Maduro, we can enjoy the DSL, though it is expensive. 2 MB costs about $4,000 U.S. dollars a month.

If GSM site, this is where we installed the 3 G networks. We this Atol because broadband centre is only 2 G. They're having problems upgrading because it's like throwing away an investment. So we can still see smartphones on that atol and then dumb phones on the urban centre as we call it. So these are the telecentre installations, just a picture.

Okay. These are the leapfrog events for the RMI 1990s to 2009 by satellite connectivity. 64 KBPS the fastest Internet speed available during those times. And it is $80 U.S. dollars per month while the outer island communicates through the HF radio.

By 2010, fiberoptic cable arrived, 80 gigabyte capacity, 20 MBPS for $10,000 U.S. dollars ADSL commercial. So 56 KBPS roughly $40 U.S. dollars per month. ADS residential. It's very expensive. 2010 MOTC and ‑‑ signed an MOU on any projects that we engage into. 2012 conclusion of the DAMA system rollout in the outer islands. There is centres. And then free Internet connection for one year. That's their marketing strategy for the outer island. By 2013, fiberoptic cable laying in Majuro, capital of Marshall Islands and installation of seamless WiFi.

>> I'm sorry. Pakistan ‑‑ (non‑English).

>> I will speed it up. This is our MOU signing. And then this is the Secretary Felipo, this is Honorable Senator Tony Molar. And previously CEO NTA. I'm almost done. This is the practical presentation of Majuro. That is still the U.S. history, January 2002, 2003, 2007 we tried to regain the, but June 2013 we recovered our.mh. This is our publishing our.mh recovery domain. You'll see the Vice President of ICANN stakeholder engagement.

I'm going past the regulation. Internet Society is yet to be conducted. Cybercrime bill is being lodged at the moment. Office of telecommunications, same thing, being lodged, lobbied Senate and legislators. Child online protection working with impact, IC‑related projects which involves ITU and APT.

On behalf of the republic of the Marshall Islands, local language, thank you very much.

[Applause.]

>> Thank you very much. So the Internet connectivity across the ocean, this might be the exemplary case. John, you are from AIC, we will hear from him and also one government official from Pakistan is connected with us through online.

>> JOHN URE: Thank you. Let me very briefly firstly introduce the Asia Internet coalition, which was formed in 2010 and officially registered in 2011. And the current members of the coalition are these companies who are pretty familiar, I think, to most people.

The purpose of forming the Asia Internet coalition was to promote, in broad terms, free and open access to the Internet, to encourage that in the policies to be adopted by governments throughout Asia as a means, not just of providing access to the Internet for the population as a whole, but also as a means of building the digital economy, which we see as being vital to any country that is involved in global trading today. It's as simple as that.

I think Asia Pacific has been facing the kinds of issues that North America and Europe faced a few years ago; namely, that as the Internet has spread like a wildfire, particularly through the use of mobile, because in Asia Pacific, the means by which most people now, especially young people and people in emerging economies, access the Internet is more by mobile phone and more mobile broadband phone.

So the issues that having Internet access raise are really being confronted by governments across the region in Asia Pacific now in a way that, really, they weren't five or ten years ago. Our concern is that with the best will in the world, the governments in the region often are not sure how to go about handling the issues that arise from the growth of the Internet.

Let me just very briefly kind of put this in a context that I think is very important. Governments, as most people my age were brought up dealing with what I call a linear society. Mass communication society where people got their entertainment and information from radio and from television, from newspapers. Education was organized from the top down. Everything was linear. And everybody pretty much knew what their role was in that linear society, including governments. And governments were organized in linear fashions with different ministries, in silos, basically, looking out for different aspects of the economy.

We have now moved into an entirely different era, which is essentially a nonlinear era. And maybe in Q & A, we can discuss that in a little bit more detail. But what that means in principle is that the kinds of rules and regulations that were applied in the linear world, for example, to the press or to the television media or to the cinema, even, like censorship of films which didn't comply with local, social and cultural traditions, those approaches to laws, regulations just don't really work in a nonlinear society. They just do not work. Because in a nonlinear society, everything is interconnected. You can access these things through so many different platforms. There are so many different ways in and out of the Information Society, which is good because it opens up space for people to innovate. And innovation is the basis of a digital economy. So the laws, rules and regulations, if they're simply taken from the old book and applied to the new situation are likely to have quite detrimental effects. They are likely to dampen the role of innovation. They are likely to, even if you provide access to the Internet, the way that people use it will be very limited and will be very restricted.

So I'm going to just take one example where we as a coalition have made representations to a government. It happens to be ‑‑ the example I'm going to take is the government of Vietnam because Vietnam is at the moment looking at these issues. Previously we've made representations in Hong Kong, Philippines, Thailand and so on. Just going to mention Vietnam because there is a new decree that has just come into effect. And there is a cyber ‑‑ an Internet security bill or paper being discussed.

The points that we have made to the government in Vietnam ‑‑ and this is on our web site this is public domain ‑‑ is that, firstly, as far as cyber security is concerned, which is a genuine issue that every government, not just governments, companies and private individuals have to take very seriously, the rules and regulations that are being proposed, we believe, should not be overprescriptive. They should not try to cover everything in detail for the simple reason that the way the Internet is developing and being used, it cannot be foreseen how things will be in five, 10 years' time. So it has to be much more selective, in our view, about things which are ‑‑ which we can all agree on need to be controlled or limited. I mean, child pornography, for example, I don't think anyone is going to disagree with the importance of trying to restrict child pornography.

But there are other issues, such as, for example, free speech where people say things that you don't like. Now, where they say something which is absolutely libelous and where the intention is libelous, then clearly there's a legal issue there. But where the intention is not libelous, where somebody has said something that is just simply wrong, there are other ways of handling it, like takedown notices, apologies, et cetera. This is a question of proportionality. So laws should be proportional. They should not be blanket. They shouldn't be overall prescriptions.

There should also be a kind of give‑and‑take in terms of what people can and cannot do with information that they receive over the Internet. If everything becomes a security issue, then the role of the Internet in an Information Society will simply be undermined.

Furthermore, it will create problems in dealing with foreign countries, foreign companies, like, for example, our members because these members happen to, of course, be ‑‑ these all happen to be at the moment American‑based companies, but hopefully we will have some non‑American‑based companies coming into the coalition. So they are restricted by in this case American law about what kind of information that they can share between borders, over across borders. So if there are countries in the region which are being overprescriptive and which, for example, demand and require Internet companies to share and give information to governments about individuals posting stuff on the Internet, then international companies cannot work in that environment. And therefore the amount of cross‑border information and trade and investment is bound to be restricted. So this is one of the points that we've been making to the government in Vietnam.

And I just want to pick up just a couple of slides on the decree and I hope he will come back to me and give his opinions if he wants.

Firstly, illegal content. I can't read it up here. Forbidden content is overly broad, in our view. It leaves interpretation up to subjective government officials. What is and what is not illegal content? It has the significant potential to limit free expression. So I think what is illegal needs to be much narrowly defined. As I say, this happens to be a case of Vietnam, but this would apply to any government anywhere in the world to want to introduce Internet regulation.

User data requirements. The decree mandates cooperation with the relevant authorities to provide information on users. It appears that cooperation means if the government asks the service provider provides or complies. There is no process of oversight. There is no independent body to kind of make an adjudication as to whether that's a reasonable request or not a reasonable. We suggest that governments, all governments, have an oversight process.

Local service ‑‑ server requirements. The domestic service providers are mandated to place at least one server in Vietnam so authorities can have access to user data. This means domestic companies cannot use international platforms. For example, potentially app engine AWS app store, et cetera. So this is highly restrictive. And the impact of that is upon local Internet businesses. And it will restrict the growth of local Internet businesses. And therefore the digital economy.

Licensing requirements. Licenses are required of local entrepreneurs before they can begin building a website or a social network. So to get started, they first need to hire a lawyer instead of a developer, which may mean that many of them won't get started at all. In other words, there are plenty of examples in other countries on things like company law where if somebody wants to start up a company, the actual procedures are so complex and lengthy and so on and so forth that if you want to facilitate the development of a digital economy, then make it as easy as possible for people to start up. I think it's fairly simple to say that.

So these happen to be the two references which are on our website and I would invite people to go and have a look at them.

So the general point I'm making is that every government has to struggle with these genuine problems. Nobody has 100 percent the right answer. I mean, it's all trial and error. But don't use rules, regulations, processes which were appropriate to a linear age, a pre‑Internet age and try and apply them into an Internet age. We're living in a different kind of world now. And we have to think afresh. And the discussion earlier this morning about stakeholder involvement, the real reason for that is because none of us individually have all the answers. We have to have a dialogue on those issues. Thank you.

[Applause.]

>> Thank you very, very much. Actually, you made a really good point and it would be very much appreciated by many government representatives participating in this session. We are living in a fast moving environment. So when we set up a policy, we need to think about the fast changes. Thank you very much for sharing your insight.

This issue ‑‑ actually, you know, this topic is a very interesting topic so it requires a lot more time to discuss in depth. So one thing I'd like to ask for your understanding is we still have some of the presenters and we are supposed today finish the session by 6:00. We actually took some time to get the settings. So we actually started 10 minutes late. So if you are all fine, then please have 10 more minutes before finish. I know that you must be very tired. But please spare 10 more minutes because it's a really valuable precious session.

The Pakistan is going to be with us sometime soon. And next, we will actually hear from Mr. Peter Major. He's working UN‑‑ at the moment. His topic is the advance Working Group, the corporation Working Group. He has past experience. And based on his experience, he will also talk about the government's efforts to expand broadband infrastructure. He will actually make good advice and comment on this. Please let's hear from Pakistan first.

[Silence.]

>> Can you see my screen shared already? Can you hear me well now? Thank you very much for the opportunity. You can look at my screen. You will see, did you know that there are 50 million Internet users in Pakistan? 15 million of whom browse the Web through their mobile phones. Okay. I would like to speak more louder if you can hear me well, that's very good. I will try to speak because we had the problem with the mics in the early session, as well.

So if you look at the key statistics of Pakistan, you will have the copies of the presentation afterwards, as well, so you can go through it and if you have any questions, you can get back to me on the subject because I would like to have continued discussion on this subject.

Pakistan is has 119 million population. 36 people live in urban areas and 64 people live in rural areas. The Internet users in Pakistan are 30 million at this point of time. The Internet penetration is 16 percent. Mobile users we have now is 120 million if you look at the number, this is a very good number. Everything is less than $3,000. Let's see how the population uses. 70 percent of the population who uses the Internet through mobile phone, smartphones or through PCs or other means are under the age of 30. Despite the financial challenges in Pakistan, we are connected to device and content that they offer. That includes shopping, watching weather, information, (breaking up).

You can see here on the graph, we have 120 million subscribers adding 1 million a month, which is a very, very good sign in Asia Pacific market to emerge as one of the market leaders.

Mobile phone Internet users have 8 percent penetration. Broadband subscribers are more than doubled in two years, which is 2.2 million. The view is the Pakistan is the fifth largest market in Asia. It is the fifth largest mobile Internet market in Asia. We must concentrate on this market, which is a very potential market. 10 percent of the people use smart phones and it's penetrating very well. We have androids and other smartphones available. All the latest versions, including all Samsung phones are available here in Pakistan market on a daily basis. 75 percent of the phones still I don't ‑‑ because of the Nokia market was larger. 80 percent of the phone costs less than $100. Mobile Internet is 11 percent. Internet for mobile phone out of 120 million page previews in April is 11 percent. Did you know that 80 percent of the Internet users spend more than an hour on it every day? But the average session is only five minutes. So I made my presentation according to the requirement of this workshop that if we look at the accessibility in Asia Pacific region in context of Pakistan, this is a small structure of the presentation because I will try to finish this presentation in the next five minutes. So I will share map of the Pakistan current survey that we have done last month. The challenges and solutions of Internet access, ways to improve the situation and the international cooperation. The most important for the cooperation of the Internetal is the capacity building at the transfer of the technology and the knowledge that we would acquire from countries like South Korea, ministry of science and technology and other people in the region of Asia Pacific.

Let me be just quick. This is the map of Pakistan as you can see in our region which is one side we have India the other side we have China. We are in the centre of most populated population which is in the Internet in Pakistan. The current status survey that we have done recently last month, based on this, if you take a ballpark number, there would be over 20 million Pakistanis online. And the numbers are going very fast. Let's just break up the number. The people who use laptops are 85 percent and the people who use mobile phone and Internet are 65 percent of the total responding. We have noticed a majority of responded 91 percent have Internet in dialups. 60 percent of the people pay less than 1,500 rubies which is almost like $10, less than $10. So if you look at it, the people using on the graph on following devices they use desk tops, laptops, tablets now and mobile phones. So the market is changing. The survey was done by one of the leading newspapers, which it has connection with the international Tribune.

Let's go back to the monthly Internet spending. People spend less than 500 rubies, 1,000 to 5,000 rubies and over 3,000 rupees. They average 104 rupees at this time. Hours spent online daily, if you look at the numbers, the average people spend over more than five hours daily, social media, they use chatting, they do online shopping. Even they have registered low response but it's there.

If you look at this graph again, you see how the social media is used in terms of the mobile Internet and other. All the responding use Facebook, Twitter, linked in and unfortunately we have issues with the YouTube but there is a very bigger roar people use YouTube. They use Internet for social, network, email, work, entertainment, and shopping. The grasp explains how often they use ‑‑ graph ‑‑ or sometimes never use.

Okay. I will quickly finish in the next two minutes the challenges and solutions of the Internet. The current challenges we have of the Internet in Pakistan is Internet censorship in Pakistan. In 2012 there were implemented a national URL filtering blocking system, which ‑‑ has published a proposal and started working on that which is not a good sign in terms of the PT because the staff we have has been trained by Internet Society several times and by the international organizations ICANN and UN. But still when they come back, they develop this kind of system to block Internet, Facebook, Twitter and YouTube. So I would trust the international community and others to help us out, solve ‑‑ look at the numbers they are blocking, they are social media sites they block, perhaps Pakistan does not even have access to the YouTube it's been closed for more than a year. The government's considering lifting the ban. Due to ban on Pakistan, last year September because of the films that were released in July to 13, the government announced that they're going to reopen in the second week of August, which is already passed, a 12‑member committee is working under the Chairmanship of Minister of IT. They have got to filter from a local Internet service provider which is PTC‑‑ after the filtration will get tested and they will be able to use the YouTube. Challenges and solution we have because YouTube is accessed by our education, we have virtual university, we have like 40,000 radios and there are like thousands and thousands of economic institutions who have uploaded the videos and everything and news channels and everything. This is a gray area that needs to be discussed with the community, how we can solve it. I know some of the Asian governments have already solved the issue.

There was protests after Arab, you know that started. We have the filter. But the policy of the government is very clear. They want Internet freedom to strengthen the democracy. So they are preparing to lift a one year old ban on the Internet. They have blocked like 4,000 URLs. But still more can be on the Internet Governance policy blogs. So you can read with what is happening with Pakistan.

Plan and ways to include the solution, we need to have Asia Pacific in Pakistan multilingual meetings there. We need to have Internet which is affordable to people of a developing country and has universal access and cultural diversification. Human Rights is most important thing. We need to have freedom of expression, data protection and privacy rights and consumer rights. That's the plan and the way to improve domestic situation here. Trade in commerce is very important. Pakistan has very good relationship with Korea. We're very kind to us. They developed our first motor way. Providers, bus service and other facilities. So we would like to also hem us out in developing our super information highway where we can do e‑commerce with proper copyrights, patents, trademark, security and law enforcement, ITC.

I see there's a lot of people sitting in Australia and Internet, combating cyberspace, we are in a war the last 10 years, so we would like you to help us in this issue, as well. We'd like to minimize the misuse of the Internet, protecting our children and young people from abusing. And finally the recommendations as for international Pakistan to work closely with Asian countries. We have been recently the Prime Minister in August clearly identified the technical in important in Asian country. Pakistan would like to work closely with them ISPS and cooperation in AP region. Pakistan is fully aware of the Internet importance of the joint discussion of the other governments in Asia region. We'd like to be part of that. Pakistan hopes this Forum can serve as a step towards future cooperation amongst government especially in Asia Pacific region and sustainable development in the region with ICT. We Pakistan would like to share and use the AP region experiences in terms of building our capacity, technical knowledge so we can implement the plan and this recommendation.

Thank you very much, everyone, for your time. You can contact me on the following details and the presentation copy will be available to you from the local. Thank you. If you have any questions, please feel free to ask. Thank you.

[Applause.]

(Non‑English, nontranslated.)

Peter Major?

>> Thank you. I am in a very delicate situation. On one hand, I listened to all the presentations about accessibility. Well I would rather call it access and infrastructure. But being the last one to present, I'm probably eating up your time for the question and answer, so I'll try to be very brief.

I learned a lot from all the presentations, both the success stories and both the concerns which were mentioned during all these presentations.

As I was introduced, I am ambassador of the commission of science for development which is a UN commission. And in particular what is interest for you is I am chairing the Working Group on the enhance cooperation. And many issues which have been brought up here explicitly or implicitly are concerns to this group itself. So just getting back to the opening sessions we had this morning, WSIS, Information Society was mentioned. One of the results was the IGF the Internet Governance Forum, and the other outcome was the enhance corporation. IGF Forum and we are talking about the eighth one, which is going to take place in Bali next month can be really regarded as a success story.

However, enhanced cooperation which is a kind of vague idea how governments should be involved in Internet Governance especially in public policy issues and not in the operating, operational problems is something which gave concern over and over again to many people.

Some stakeholders think that enhanced cooperation is already happening, and we have heard some examples how countries are helping other Developing Countries to improve their infrastructure to give capacity building and so on and so forth. However, other countries think that enhanced cooperation doesn't happen. So the role of this Working Group, which was initiated by the UN resolution last year, last December, is to take input from all stakeholders and to compile this input with the view of giving some recommendations as to how the enhanced cooperation can be put into practice.

I have to mention to you, as you have heard this morning, the Internet Governance is based on the multistakeholder approach. So this Working Group is also a multistakeholder Working Group, which is very rare in the UN environment.

The group itself is made up of 22 countries, government representatives, and five representatives of each stack holder, academia, technical communities, business, international organizations and civil societies.

As I mentioned to you, the group has fulfilled its mandate, and it should come up with recommendations how governments should fulfill their roles in the public policy issues vis‑a‑vis Internet Governance.

Just to give you some idea how we are ‑‑ how we have started working on these issues, we had our first meeting after the final composition was decided, in April we started our work in May. End of May. And we have come up with a questionnaire, which is quite a complex questionnaire about what are the issues we are going to deal with? And we wanted to have responses from the different stakeholders. Up to now, to my best knowledge, we have had about 60 responses. And the deadline has been extended up to Tuesday next week. I believe we will approach the 100 responses, which is quite a substantial number. And considering the difficulties and the seriousness of the questionnaires, we are going to deal with a document of about 1,000 to 1500 pages, which is unmanageable, so we have to try to size it down and try to find a summary to it in order that the Working Groups should start working seriously.

As I mentioned to you, it's a multistakeholder approach, and I try to have it as open as possible, but it has been opened up to observers. It is going to be streamed, audio streamed, eventually there will be remote participation. So I believe this is kind of a first‑time experience in the UN to have such a broad participation within the UN ‑‑ which was quite an open group, but it was hand picked by the secretary general of the UN. This time is more ‑‑

Now as I mentioned at the beginning, each country may learn from the other country's experience. I find this session extremely useful. And we can learn from the successes and we can learn from the failures, as well. So we shouldn't be ashamed of having failed because other people may learn from that.

And it has been mentioned that Internet is a global entity. So countries have to cooperate. There is no question about it.

We have learned a lot about access, security issues, Intellectual Property issues, trade issues and so on. And in general all these need to be handled in a framework which is a global framework for international public policy discussions.

So as a conclusion, in the present political environment we are in now, I think it's extremely important that this group produce results and face all the issues which have been mentioned extremely seriously. I'm aware that there will be very small number of issues we can have agreement on. But, still, if we can have agreement on a few of them, I think it's already a success. And the last were about the future of the IGF and the present meeting. I think as was mentioned by Jim, the approaches we are taking in the present policy making is linear, I would call it hierarchical. But I fully agree that we should adopt a new way of thinking, and I believe the Working Group I have mentioned to you is a small contribution to this direction. Thank you.

[Applause.]

>> Thank you very much for sharing your insight. Actually, many people are very interested in the topic discussed in UNC today. Enhanced cooperation, the issues you have mentioned were actually discussed in the last May in WTPF meeting. And this is going to be discussed again in the future. So a lot of attention have been paid to this issue. We really hope that a lot of multistakeholders actively participate so with e can reach a consensus.

We are actually running out of time. And we are actually quite late. We are well beyond the schedule, so if you have a really urgent question, please raise it. If you have urgent question. If you have question, you should raise it right now, please raise it.

Due to time constraints, we apologize for not being able to take questions. And, lastly, the panels and participants, if you have any last comment, please share it with us.

If you have any comments to share, please share it with us. Thank you very much for having presented this session. Listening from you in this session, I believe that the Internet, the trend of Internet is very much different depending upon which country, which geographical condition you are living in. In case of Korea, our population is very high. That is why we were successfully able to implement Internet infrastructure, but some countries are not in the same situation. You know the Internet service, it could be very much localized, however the feature of the Internet is very much global. So as Peter Major shared with us, when each government, when they think about the policy of Internet, they should think about some mixed and uncomplex situation rather than taking some linear approach. Korean government is also very much interested in this. And Korea Internet alliance has already been forged. This is the place where the civil experts are actually joining together to talk about this issue. We really hope Korea will make good contribution to the development of Internet Governance in the future. Thank you very much for your attendance. Thank you.

[Applause.]

(end of meeting).

>> It's 6:25. Enjoy your dinner. Thank you.

\* \* \* \* \*

This is being provided in a rough‑draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in Order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

\* \* \* \* \*